**Persistent Anti-Correlations in Brownian Dynamics Simulations of Dense Colloidal Suspensions Revealed by Noise Suppression**

Suvenu Mandal, Lukas Schrack, Hartmut Löwen, Matthias Sperl, and Thomas Franosch

1. Institut für Theoretische Physik II: Weiche Materie, Heinrich-Heine-Universität Düsseldorf, Universitätsstraße 1, 40225 Düsseldorf, Germany
2. Institut für Theoretische Physik, Universität Innsbruck, Technikerstraße 21A, A-6020 Innsbruck, Austria
3. Institut für Materialphysik im Weltraum, Deutsches Zentrum für Luft- und Raumfahrt, 51170 Köln, Germany
4. Institut für Theoretische Physik, Universität zu Köln, Zülpicher Straße 77, 50937 Köln, Germany

(Received 24 April 2019; revised manuscript received 28 August 2019; published 15 October 2019)

Transport properties of a hard-sphere colloidal fluid are investigated by Brownian dynamics simulations. We implement a novel algorithm for the time-dependent velocity-autocorrelation function (VACF) essentially eliminating the noise of the bare random motion. The measured VACF reveals persistent anti-correlations manifested by a negative algebraic power-law tail $t^{-5/2}$ at all densities. At small packing fractions the simulations fully agree with the analytic low-density prediction, yet the amplitude of the tail becomes dramatically suppressed as the packing fraction is increased. The mode-coupling theory of the glass transition provides a qualitative explanation for the strong variation in terms of the static compressibility as well as the slowing down of the structural relaxation.

Introduction.—In a fluid the velocity autocorrelation function (VACF) in equilibrium encodes the self-diffusion coefficient as its time-integral, similar Green-Kubo relations exist for all transport coefficients such as viscosity or heat conductivity [1]. For underlying Newtonian dynamics it is well established since the late 1960s by the pioneering simulations of Alder and Wainwright [2], exact theoretical results [3,4], and experiments [5–8] that the VACF and other relevant correlation functions display an algebraic power-law decay $t^{-3/2}$ in 3D. Such tails then imply a non-analytic behavior for the frequency-dependent transport coefficients. The origin of these persistent correlations is traced back to the slow diffusion of conserved transverse momentum [1,2,9,10]. Similar tails also arise due to the presence of boundaries [6,11,12] or in the presence of disorder [13–15] or even driven granular systems [16].

For a colloidal suspension, velocity is not an observable anymore, rather it fluctuates without bounds, momentum is lost incessantly due to friction and gained by thermal noise. Nevertheless, a VACF $Z(t)$ can be defined formally by

$$Z(t) = \frac{1}{6} \frac{d^2}{dt^2} \langle [\mathbf{R}(t) - \mathbf{R}(0)]^2 \rangle, \quad t > 0, \quad (1)$$

thereby extending the connection with the mean-square displacement also to the colloidal case. Recently, there has been experimental progress to monitor with high precision the VACF of an isolated colloïd in a solvent held by an optical trap [5–8] and confirm that the coupling to the solvent gives rise to long-time tails as above and colored noise as predicted theoretically [17,18].

In Brownian dynamics (BD) the solvent is treated only implicitly by Gaussian white noise and friction, correspondingly these hydrodynamic tails due to momentum conservation do not occur. Yet, exact low-density expansions [19–21] developed in the early 1980s of the many-body Smoluchowski equation in 3D predict a similar long-time behavior for the VACF, although more rapidly decaying $t^{-5/2}$ and with negative prefactor. The tails arise due to particle conservation and reflect the repeated encounters with the same scatterer. Roughly speaking, the particle “remembers” that a second colloid is blocking the way in the relative motion, the constraint fading away only slowly by diffusion. Generally, these tails appear as a universal feature of strongly interacting particle systems lacking momentum conservation. In contrast to the hydrodynamic tails, there appears to be only rudimentary data analysis [22] of BD simulation results to corroborate the persistent tails. The difficulty in obtaining accurate results in BD simulations is that the mean-square displacement is dominated by the white noise keeping the dynamics in equilibrium. For dilute systems the interactions leading to deviations from conventional diffusion are rare events and get buried completely in the noise. For higher packing fractions there is a significant suppression of the diffusive motion, yet the persistent tails (if they prevail beyond the low-density regime) are again hard to extract from noisy data.

In this Letter we present BD simulation data for the VACF over several orders of magnitude in time and amplitude, thereby confirming the existence of such long-time tails for the first time. The key ingredient is an adaption of an algorithm originally introduced by Frenkel [13] for a single.
particle on a lattice. At the lowest packing fractions $\varphi$ the data are fully described by the low-density expansion, in particular we reproduce the short-time divergence as well as the predicted long-time tail. We show that the mode-coupling theory (MCT) of the glass transition for colloids also yields a long-time tail provided the low-wavelength dynamics is properly resolved. The trends in the amplitude of the tail in the simulation are rationalized within MCT. Furthermore, we elaborate the MCT prediction for the VACF in the vicinity of the glass transition.

**Model and simulation.**—To unravel the VACF in detail, we investigate a hard-sphere colloidal fluid with particles of identical diameters $\sigma$ and short-time diffusion coefficient $D_0$ at packing fraction $\varphi = n \sigma^3 \pi / 6$ [1]. Correspondingly, $t_0 = \sigma^2 / D_0$ sets the basic unit of time; $Z(t) \sigma^2 / D_0^2$ is the dimensionless VACF. We rely on event-driven Brownian dynamics simulations [23–26] for 1000 particles using a fixed Brownian time step and evolve the particles ballistically including collisions.

Yet, for low densities most of the time no collisions occur and the dynamics is dominated by the noise of the free Brownian motion. Motivated by Frenkel [13], we propose a novel method, which generates two trajectories for an identical Brownian motion ignoring interactions. Accordingly, we split the total displacement of a particle into two contributions

$$\Delta \mathbf{R}(t) = \Delta \mathbf{R}_0(t) + \delta \mathbf{R}(t),$$

where $\Delta \mathbf{R}_0(t)$ represents the random displacement of the noninteracting trajectory. The difference $\delta \mathbf{R}(t)$ is then the collision-induced displacement. Then the mean-square displacement evaluates to

$$\langle \Delta \mathbf{R}(t)^2 \rangle = 6 D_0 t - \langle \delta \mathbf{R}(t)^2 \rangle + 2 \langle \Delta \mathbf{R}(t) \cdot \delta \mathbf{R}(t) \rangle. \quad (3)$$

The mean-square displacement (MSD) is evaluated for packing fractions ranging from the dilute regime, $\varphi = 0.005$, to just below the freezing transition, $\varphi = 0.48$, see Fig. 1. Both the short-time diffusive motion $\langle \Delta \mathbf{R}(t)^2 \rangle = 6 D_0 t, t \to 0$, as well as the long-time diffusion $\langle \Delta \mathbf{R}(t)^2 \rangle = 6 D^{(s)} t, t \to \infty$ is properly resolved. From the data we extract the long-time self-diffusion coefficient $D^{(s)}$ and observe a slowing down by a factor of $\approx 7$ with respect to the free motion. The crossover regime extends over two decades for the highest densities but appears to be a featureless smooth interpolation.

Clearly, for low densities, the correction terms become small relative to the bare diffusion term by construction. Yet, the simulations reveal that the cross-correlation term $2 \langle \Delta \mathbf{R}(t) \cdot \delta \mathbf{R}(t) \rangle$ in the MSD is at least by two orders of magnitude smaller than the correction term $\langle \delta \mathbf{R}(t)^2 \rangle$, see Fig. 1(b). We have checked that this hierarchy of contributions persists to all densities. This observation suggests that we can ignore the cross-correlation completely. Then the collision-induced mean-square displacement captures the suppression of diffusion, reflecting that interaction can only slow down the MSD.

Upon taking derivatives in Eq. (3), the bare diffusion term drops out for $t > 0$ while it formally yields a contribution $6 D_0 \delta(t)$ at the time origin. The remaining terms can be differentiated numerically and yield high-accuracy data for the VACF. Note that in the low-density regime $\delta \mathbf{R}(t)$ evaluates to zero most of the time, since few collisions occur. Using the observation that the cross-correlation can be ignored, a noise suppression by more than two orders of magnitude is achieved at low densities, see Supplemental Material [27].

The computed VACF reveal nontrivial correlations beyond the crossover regime, see Fig. 2. Our data cover five decades in time and more than five orders of magnitude in signal. The data clearly display an anti-correlated long-time tail.
that the amplitude is suppressed by a factor of fractions. For the lowest densities we compare to the exact behavior approaching the freezing transition. All simulation data also display a divergent short-time divergence $t^{-1/2}$ for $t \to 0$ as the simulation data and the exact low-density result. To gain further insight into how MCT encodes the tail we analyze the behavior of the equations analytically for low densities and for long and short times. In the low-density regime $c(k) = 4\pi |\sin(\kappa r) - \kappa r \cos(\kappa r)|/k^3$, the force kernel $\zeta^{(s)}(t)$, Eq. (7), simplifies and reproduces the weak-coupling approximation [47–50] (essentially second order perturbation in the interaction). Here the intermediate scattering functions have to be evaluated for the noninteracting system $S(k, t) \to \exp(-D_0 k^2 t)$, $S^{(s)}(k, t) \to \exp(-D_0 k^2 t)$. Then, for low densities one finds $Z(t) = -D_0^2 \beta^2 \zeta^{(s)}(t)$ from in particular the MSD, have been developed earlier [39] and successfully compared to experiments [40–43] and simulations [44]. Thus, in principle the VACF can be obtained by taking derivatives as in Eq. (1). Yet, so far MCT equations relied on equidistant grids in wave number space and cannot properly resolve long-wavelength phenomena arising from a continuum of wave numbers.

Here we rely on the Zwanzig-Mori procedure [37,45,46] for an exact equation of motion for the VACF in terms of the irreducible memory kernel $\zeta^{(s)}(t)$ (the autocorrelation function of the fluctuating force with projected dynamics)

\[
 Z(t) + D_0^2 \beta^2 \zeta^{(s)}(t) + D_0 \beta^2 \int_0^t \zeta^{(s)}(t-t')Z(t')dt' = 0,
 \]

for $t > 0$. Within MCT [38] the memory kernel is connected to the self-intermediate scattering functions of the collective $S(k, t)$ and self-motion $S^{(s)}(k, t)$ by an integral over all wave numbers

\[
 \beta^2 \zeta^{(s)}(t) = \frac{n}{6\pi^2} \int_0^\infty dk k^2 c(k)^2 S(k, t)S^{(s)}(k, t),
 \]

where $c(k)$ is the direct correlation function [1]. The intermediate scattering functions $S(k, t), S^{(s)}(k, t)$ are required as input for the memory kernel $\zeta^{(s)}(t)$. Then the VACF follows by a numerical solution of Eq. (6). We solve numerically the standard MCT equations, yet to resolve the long-wavelength dynamics, we rely on a grid with logarithmic spacing, see Supplemental Material [27] for details.

The numerical results for the VACF within MCT display a long-time tail for all packing fractions, see Fig. 3. It is well-known that MCT overestimates the slowing-down or the structural relaxation. For comparison with the simulation results, the packing fractions in MCT have been chosen to match the suppression of diffusion obtained from simulation results. The overall shape of the VACF compares favorably to the simulation results, in particular, we reproduce the strong density dependence of the prefactor of the long-time tail. Nevertheless, it appears that the suppression of the tail is even more drastic in MCT than in simulations, see the inset of Fig. 3. The MCT results show a similar short-time divergence $t^{-5/2}$ for $t \to 0$ as the simulation data and the exact low-density result.

To gain further insight into how MCT encodes the tail we analyze the behavior of the equations analytically for low densities and for long and short times. In the low-density regime $c(k) = 4\pi |\sin(\kappa r) - \kappa r \cos(\kappa r)|/k^3$, the force kernel $\zeta^{(s)}(t)$, Eq. (7), simplifies and reproduces the weak-coupling approximation [47–50] (essentially second order perturbation in the interaction). Here the intermediate scattering functions have to be evaluated for the noninteracting system $S(k, t) \to \exp(-D_0 k^2 t)$, $S^{(s)}(k, t) \to \exp(-D_0 k^2 t)$. Then, for low densities one finds $Z(t) = -D_0^2 \beta^2 \zeta^{(s)}(t)$ from

\[
 Z(t) = -8\varphi B(\varphi) \frac{D_0^2}{\sigma^2} \left\{ \sqrt{\frac{t}{t_0}} \cos(4t/t_0)[1 - 2S(\sqrt{8t/\pi t_0})] + \sin(4t/t_0)[1 - 2C(\sqrt{8t/\pi t_0})] \right\},
 \]

for all packing fractions with the anticipated exponent $-5/2$ and dimensionless prefactor $\varphi B(\varphi)$. Since a non-trivial VACF arises only in the interacting system, we have included $\varphi$ explicitly in the prefactor. Our simulation results show that $B(\varphi \to 0) \approx 0.14$ saturates for small packing fractions. For the lowest densities we compare to the exact analytical results [19–21]

\[
 Z(t) \approx -8\varphi B(\varphi) \frac{D_0^2}{\sigma^2} \left\{ \sqrt{\frac{t}{t_0}} - \cos(4t/t_0)[1 - 2S(\sqrt{8t/\pi t_0})] + \sin(4t/t_0)[1 - 2C(\sqrt{8t/\pi t_0})] \right\},
 \]

for the first-order in the low-density expansion. Here $S(\cdot)$ and $C(\cdot)$ denote the Fresnel integrals [34]. Our data nicely follow the theoretical prediction for $\varphi \lesssim 0.01$, in particular, they exhibit the long-time tail with exact prefactor $B(\varphi \to 0) = \frac{3}{8\sqrt{\pi}}$. For larger packing fractions, the prefactor $B(\varphi)$ displays a strong density dependence beyond the low-density prediction, Fig. 2 (Inset). We find that the amplitude is suppressed by a factor of $\approx 110$ upon approaching the freezing transition.

All simulation data also display a divergent short-time behavior $Z(t) \sim -t^{-1/2}$, $t \to 0$, which is a peculiarity of the hard-sphere interaction [35,36]; this discussion is deferred to the Supplemental Material [27].

Mode-coupling theory.—Numerical solutions of the colloidal MCT equations [37,38] for the self-motion and,
FIG. 3. Mode-coupling-theory results for the reduced VACF $Z(t)/\varphi$ for packing fraction $\varphi$ with Percus-Yevick closure such that the diffusion coefficients match the simulation results. The short-dashed line indicates a power law $t^{-5/2}$ and serves as a guide to the eye. The long-dashed line corresponds to the weak-coupling approximation (w.c.a.) and is virtually on top of the MCT result for the lowest packing fraction. Inset: Prefactor of the tail vs packing fraction.

Eq. (6) for all times. The analytical result of the weak-coupling approximation is included in Fig. 3 and coincides with the numerical MCT solution for $\varphi \leq 0.005$. Interestingly, for the rather low packing fraction $\varphi = 0.10$, MCT yields already a long-time tail in $Z(t)/\varphi$ suppressed by a factor of 5, while in our simulations, $Z(t)/\varphi$ is suppressed by a factor of 4.

Mode-coupling theory provides an explanation for the origin of the tails similar to the classic hydrodynamic tails [3,4], which are due to transverse momentum conservation. In our case the coupling of the collective and self-intermediate scattering functions in the force, Eq. (7), yields a slowly decaying contribution for long wavelengths. For long times the integral is dominated by small wave numbers where the intermediate scattering functions $S(k,t) \approx S(0) \exp[-D_0 k^2 t/S(0)]$, $S^{(s)}(k,t) \approx \exp(-D^{(s)} k^2 t)$ approach diffusive motion. Here $D^{(s)}$ is again the long-time self-diffusion coefficient and $D_0/S(0)$ the collective diffusion coefficient (which is time-independent as a consequence of Newton’s third law [48]). Then the MCT approximation yields a long-time tail $Z^{(s)}(t) \sim t^{-5/2}$ with a positive prefactor. The long-time behavior of the VACF $Z(t) \approx -(D^{(s)})^2 \beta^2 Z^{(s)}(t)$ follows from the equation of motion, Eq. (6), using Tauber theorems. Collecting the prefactors yields the asymptotic long-time behavior for MCT:

$$Z(t) \approx -(D^{(s)})^2 \frac{S(0) nc(0)^2}{[D^{(s)} + D_0/S(0)]^{3/2}} \frac{1}{16\pi^3} t^{-5/2}. \quad (8)$$

In particular, this yields a prediction for the low-density behavior with dimensionless amplitude $B(\varphi) = (1/6\sqrt{2\pi})$ consistent with the weak-coupling result [48]. Thus, the amplitude in weak-coupling is by a factor of 4/9 smaller than the exact low-density expansion due to repeated encounters with the same scatterer.

It is interesting to ask how the long-time anomaly evolves with increasing density. At moderate packing fractions the fluid is barely compressible, $S(0) \ll 1$ (while $nc(0) = 1 - 1/S(0) \approx -1/S(0)$ via the Ornstein-Zernike relation [1]), hence the self-diffusion coefficient can be ignored in the denominator of Eq. (8) and the prefactor displays a strong $S(0)^{3/2}$ dependence by mere compressibility effects. Upon changing the packing fraction from $\varphi = 0.005$ to $\varphi = 0.40$ the static structure factor $S(0)$ is suppressed by a factor of 24. Approaching the glass transition, the self-diffusion coefficient $D^{(s)}$ singularly goes to zero such that the tail in Eq. (8) becomes even more suppressed. At the same time the structural relaxation diverges and an intermediate window between the short-time anomaly and the long-time tail should open. Currently it appears to be unfeasible to test these predictions by simulations.

Summary and conclusion.—We have measured the VACF of an interacting colloidal system in Brownian dynamics simulations and observed an anti-correlated algebraic decay for long times. These underlying persistent correlations are masked in the MSD since the diffusive increase usually dominates. Therefore we have elaborated a novel algorithm that is sensitive only to the collisions, thereby enhancing the signal-to-noise ratio at least by an order of magnitude. The amplitude of the tail decreases by several orders of magnitude as the packing fraction is increased, which is qualitatively reproduced by MCT. The origin of the tail is also rationalized by MCT as a result of coupling of two slow diffusive modes.

While the low-density expansion is valid only up to packing fractions $\varphi \lesssim 0.01$, MCT provides a prediction for all densities, in particular, it predicts the strong suppression of the amplitude by static compressibility effects as well as by the slowing down of self-diffusion. MCT also generalizes the weak-coupling approximation where the direct correlation function is replaced by the bare interaction potential, $c(k) \rightarrow -\beta u(k)$. This replacement arises also in a factorization of Gaussian fluctuations [51,52] but can be avoided in diagrammatic approaches [53]. Generally, the tails should also be present in modified MCT approaches [54–60]. Similar persistent correlations are anticipated also for the time-dependent stress-stress correlation functions, which determines the frequency-dependent shear modulus also encoded in the MCT approach.

In Brownian dynamics the solvent exerts friction only on the single-colloid level while hydrodynamic interactions (HI) can be accounted for in Stokesian dynamics simulations [61]. The low-density prediction [19–21] has been generalized to incorporate HI and display the same long-time tail $t^{-5/2}$, albeit with a somewhat corrected prefactor.
Similarly, MCT including HI merely modifies the vertex thereby affecting only the prefactor of the tail. For high densities HI are believed not to be crucial to understand the slow structural relaxation [63]. The tail appears also in the case of quenched disorder [55,64], such as in the Lorentz gas explored by a Brownian tracer as predicted in a low-density expansion [65] and was confirmed in Brownian dynamics simulations in 2D [66]. Therefore, one anticipates that the emergence of the tail should be a universal feature for any dynamics conserving only the particle number [67].

Noise-suppression algorithms relying on identical noise histories have been introduced before, mainly in non-equilibrium Brownian dynamics [68,69]. There, the equilibrium fluctuations are subtracted to enhance the signal for the average response for small driving which otherwise is dominated by fluctuations. The method proposed in our Letter is somewhat different, rather it addresses the interactions of the particles and remains applicable even at long times.

Our method of noise suppression by decomposing the displacements into a noninteracting contribution and a collision-induced one is not restricted to hard spheres (see Supplemental Material [27] for the simulation results for soft spheres) and should apply also in the case of confinement such as porous media [55,64]. Similarly, the strategy should be applicable also beyond the mean-square displacement upon introducing covariances of fluctuating intermediate scattering functions, similar to the measures of dynamic heterogeneities in glassy relaxations [70–73]. Then, subtle dynamical correlations in Brownian systems that are usually covered by the random fluctuations of the noninteracting system become accessible in simulations. Finally, nonequilibrium simulation setups to probe the nonlinear response should also be feasible with the noise-suppression algorithm.

We gratefully acknowledge Thomas Voigtmann for inspiring discussions and Rolf Schilling for a critical reading of the manuscript. This work has been supported by the Deutsche Forschungsgemeinschaft DFG via the Research Unit FOR1394 “Nonlinear Response to Probe Vitrification” and the Project No. LO 418/23-1 and by the Austrian Science Fund (FWF): I 2887.

---


